

**CITY OF SAINT PAUL  
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT**

---

FILE NAME: 1472 Summit Avenue  
DATE OF APPLICATION: July 3, 2013  
APPLICANT: Phil & Stephanie Martineau (purchasers)/Dale Mulfinger, Sala Architects  
OWNER: Eric & Lori Kustritz  
DATE OF PUBLIC HEARING: July 25, 2013  
HPC SITE/DISTRICT: Summit Avenue West Historic District  
CATEGORY: Non-contributing  
CLASSIFICATION: Building permit  
STAFF INVESTIGATION AND REPORT: Bill Dermody  
DATE: July 18, 2013

---

**A. SITE DESCRIPTION:** The existing 1-story ranch-style, duplex home was built in 1957 and is constructed of brick and concrete block, with a partial stucco finish. There is also a stucco-finished 2-stall rear yard garage accessed via the alley to the south. The home and garage are categorized as non-contributing to the Summit Avenue West Historic District.

**B. PROPOSED CHANGES:** The applicant is proposing to demolish the existing duplex and garage, then construct a larger 2-story single-family house and 3-stall garage accessed via the alley. The proposed house is approximately 26' high (34' to peak) with an asphalt-shingled hip roof of 9:12 slope, 6" exposure cedar shake siding, primarily double-hung windows of various sizes, and significant single-story elements (covered entry in front and screened porch in rear). Other notable building elements include columns at the front entry, a copper roof atop a front bay window, a 75 sq. ft. second-story deck with trellis in the rear, an approximately 15'-high (from grade) chimney extending above the rear screened porch, and a Kasota limestone veneer around most of the building's base. The house will be set back approximately 50' from the Summit Avenue right-of-way to the north, with a second-story setback of approximately 57', which is in keeping with the surrounding homes.

The rear garage is proposed to be constructed of a similar style to the house, with cedar shake siding, double-hung windows (on north and east elevations), and an asphalt-shingled roof of 9:12 slope. The garage will also have three separate overhead doors with windows, and a 10"-wide frieze. The garage is approximately 14' high (19' to peak).

The landscape plan also proposes a new wood privacy fence in the side and rear yard, a trellis in the rear yard, and a capped retaining wall/seating wall along the eastern two-thirds of the front property line. A seating wall referenced in the application materials as an example shows stone veneer and is approximately 2' in height. Though details are not provided in the application regarding proposed grading surrounding the seating wall, staff notes that a 3' to 4' elevation drop currently exists between the front yard and sidewalk.

**C. BACKGROUND**

Staff met with the purchasers and an architect on July 1, 2013 to discuss the plans. The closing date for the property sale is set for August 1.

**D. GUIDELINE CITATIONS:**

**Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation**

1. *A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.*

2. *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
3. *Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.*
4. *Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.*
5. *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.*
6. *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*
7. *Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.*
8. *Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.*
9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*
10. *New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

### **Summit Avenue West District Guidelines**

#### **General Principles:**

1. *All work should be of a character and quality that maintains the distinguishing features of the building and the environment. The removal or alteration of distinctive architectural features should be avoided.*
2. *Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. In the event of replacement, new materials should match the original in composition, design, color, texture and appearance. Duplication of original design based on physical or pictorial evidence is preferable to using conjectural or "period" designs or using parts of other buildings.*
3. *Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship characteristic of structures or a period should be treated with sensitivity.*
4. *Buildings should be used for their originally intended purpose or compatible uses which require minimum alteration of the building and its site.*
5. *In general, buildings should be restored to their original appearance. However, alterations to buildings since their construction are sometimes significant because they reflect the history of the building and neighborhood. This significance should be respected, and restoration to an "original" appearance may not be desirable in some cases. All buildings should be recognized as products of their own time and not be altered to resemble buildings from an earlier era.*
6. *Whenever possible, new additions or alterations to structures should be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure would be unimpaired.*

#### **New Construction**

##### **General Principles**

*The basic principle for new construction in the Summit Avenue West District is to maintain the scale and quality of design of the district. The Summit Avenue West District is architecturally diverse within an*

*overall pattern of harmony and continuity. These guidelines for new construction focus on general rather than specific design elements in order to encourage architectural innovation and quality design while maintaining the harmony and continuity of the district. New construction should be compatible with the size, scale, massing, height, rhythm, setback, color, material, building elements, site design, and character of surrounding structures and the area.*

#### *Massing and Scale*

*New construction should conform to the massing, volume, height, facade proportions and scale of existing surrounding structures. The scale of the spaces between buildings and the rhythm of buildings to open space should also be carefully considered. New houses should be at least 25 feet high and relate to the height of existing adjacent houses. New college buildings should relate to nearby contributing college buildings; new college buildings with a smaller setback from Summit should have a correspondingly lower height.*

#### *Materials and Details*

*Variety in the use of architectural materials and details adds to the intimacy and visual delight of the district. But there is also an overall thread of continuity provided by the range of materials commonly used along Summit and by the way these materials are used. This thread of continuity is threatened by the introduction of new industrial materials and the aggressive exposure of earlier materials such as concrete block, metal framing, and glass. The materials and details of new construction should relate to the materials and details of existing nearby buildings.*

*Most buildings on Summit are built of high-quality materials, often with brick or stucco walls and asphalt or tile roofs. Most brick is red and tile roofs are either red or green. Vinyl, metal or hardboard siding is acceptable only for accessory structures which are not visible from Summit. Imitative materials such as artificial stone and artificial brick veneer should not be used. Materials will be reviewed to determine their appropriate use in relation to the overall design of the structure.*

*The materials and details of new college buildings should relate to the materials and details of nearby contributing college buildings. The Macalester College campus has buildings predominantly of red brick with concrete or sandstone trim. The [University] of St. Thomas presents cream-colored Kasota stone buildings to the Summit Avenue streetscape.*

*The color of materials should relate to surrounding structures and the area as well as to the style of the structure. Building permits are not required for painting and, although the Heritage Preservation Commission may review and comment on paint color, paint color is not subject to Heritage Preservation Commission approval.*

#### *Building Elements*

*Individual elements of a building should be integrated into its composition for a balanced and complete design. These elements of new construction should complement existing adjacent structures as well.*

#### *Roofs*

*There is a great variety of roof treatment along Summit, but gable and hipped roofs are most common. The skyline or profile of new construction should relate to the predominant roof shape of existing nearby buildings.*

*The recommended roof pitch for gable roofs is 9:12 and in general the minimum appropriate pitch is 8:12. Highly visible secondary structure roofs should match the roof pitch of the main structure. A 6:12 pitch may be acceptable in some cases for secondary structures which are not visible from the street.*

*Roof hardware such as skylights, vents, and metal pipe chimneys should not be placed on the front roof plane.*

#### *Windows and Doors*

*The proportion, size, rhythm and detailing of windows and doors should be compatible with that of*

existing nearby buildings. Facade openings of the same general size as those in nearby buildings are encouraged. Sliding windows, awning windows, and horizontally oriented muntins are not common in the district and are generally unacceptable. Vertical muntins and muntin grids may be acceptable when compatible with the period and style of the building. Sliding glass doors should not be used where they would be visible from the street.

Although not usually improving the appearance of a building, the use of metal windows or doors need not necessarily ruin it. The important thing is that they should look like part of the building and not like raw metal appliances. Appropriately colored bronze-toned aluminum is acceptable. Mill finish (silver) aluminum should be avoided.

#### **Porches and Decks**

Front entrance ways should be articulated with a suitable design element to provide a transitional zone between the public outdoors and the private interior, and should be appropriate in detail to the size and style of the building. If front porches are constructed, they should generally not be enclosed.

Decks should be kept to the rear of the buildings, should be visually refined, and should be integrated into the overall building design. A raised deck protruding from a single wall usually appears disjointed from the total design and is generally unacceptable.

#### **Site**

##### **Setback - Siting**

New buildings should generally face Summit Avenue and be sited at a distance not more than 5% out-of-line from the front yard setback of existing adjacent buildings. Setbacks greater than those of adjacent buildings may be allowed in some cases.

##### **Landscaping**

The streetscape can be divided into three visual areas: public, semipublic, and private. Public space is provided by the publicly owned sidewalks, boulevards, streets, and medians. Semipublic space includes front yards and side yards on corners. While privately owned, this space is open to view by passers-by. Private space is generally that which lies behind the front face of the building. Buildings, landscaping elements in front yards, and boulevard trees provide a "wall of enclosure" for the street "room." Generally, landscaping which respects the street as a public room is encouraged. Boulevard trees mark a separation between the automobile corridor and the rest of the streetscape, and should be maintained. Front yard enclosures such as hedges or walls are not common along west Summit. When they are used, they should permit visual penetration of the semipublic space. Low hedges or limestone retaining walls and visually open fences, such as wrought iron, are preferred. Chain link fences, while visually transparent, should not be used in front yards or in the front half of side yards. Privacy fences, timber retaining walls, and high hedges are also inappropriate in front yards.

##### **Garages and Parking**

Parking spaces should not be located in front yards. Residential parking spaces should be located in rear yards. If an alley is adjacent to a dwelling, any new garage should be located off the alley.

Institutional parking lots should ideally be located behind buildings where they would not be visible from Summit Avenue. When this is not possible, parking lots should be set back at least as far as the building facades and screened from view from Summit by landscaping such as hedges, brick walls, and changes of grade that sink the parking from view. Shade trees should be planted between parking lots and the street, and plant materials should relate to the traditional character of the district. The scale, level of light output, and design of parking lot lighting should be compatible with the 16 foot high lantern style lights along Summit Avenue.

##### **Demolition**

Proposals for demolishing structures, while reviewed with special care by the Heritage Preservation Commission, are not necessarily in conflict with district guidelines. When reviewing proposals for

*demolition of structures within the district, the Heritage Preservation Commission refers to Section 73.06(1)(2) of the Saint Paul Legislative Code which states the following:*

*In the case of the proposed demolition of a building, prior to approval of said demolition, the commission shall make written findings on the following: the architectural and historical merit of the building, the effect of the demolition on surrounding buildings, the effect of any proposed new construction on the remainder of the building (in case of partial demolition) and on surrounding buildings, and the economic value or usefulness of the building as it now exists or if altered or modified in comparison with the value or usefulness of any proposed structures designated to replace the present building or buildings.*

**E. FINDINGS:**

1. On March 1, 1990, the Summit Avenue West Heritage Preservation District was established under Ordinance No.17716, § 1. The Heritage Preservation Commission shall protect the architectural character of heritage preservation sites through review and approval or denial of applications for city permits for exterior work within designated heritage preservation sites §73.04.(4).
2. The house and garage are categorized as non-contributing to the Summit Avenue West Historic District.
3. **Demolition** - *In the case of the proposed demolition of a building, prior to approval of said demolition, the commission shall make written findings on the following:*
  - a. *The architectural and historical merit of the building.* The house and garage are classified as non-contributing.
  - b. *The effect of the demolition on surrounding buildings.* The demolition of the house and garage will not have a negative impact on the property and the Program for Preservation in the Summit Avenue West Historic District.
  - c. *The effect of any proposed new construction on the remainder of the building (in case of partial demolition) and on surrounding buildings.* Complete demolition of existing structures is proposed. Construction of a new 2-story single-family house is being evaluated as part of this report. If the guidelines are met, the new house will have a positive effect on the district and surrounding buildings.
  - d. *The economic value or usefulness of the building as it now exists or if altered or modified in comparison with the value or usefulness of any proposed structures designated to replace the present building or buildings.* According to the Ramsey County Assessor's Office, the property's 2013 market value is \$361,700.
4. **Massing and Scale** - The new house and garage conform to the massing, volume, height, facade proportions and scale of existing surrounding structures. The space between the house building and its neighbors maintains the existing predominant rhythm. The 26'-high new house is at least 25 feet high and relate(s) to the height of existing adjacent houses.
5. **Materials and Details** - The materials and details of the proposed house and garage, including cedar shake siding, double-hung windows, asphalt shingle roof, copper roof above the front bay window, and Kasota limestone veneer relate to the materials and details of existing nearby buildings. The siding and stone veneer relate to surrounding structures and the area as well as to the style of the structure. The garage design uses many of the same materials and details found on the house, including the siding, windows, and roof. Window and foundation specifications were not provided as part of the application and cannot be evaluated at this time. A dry stacked stone veneer limestone seating wall, such as proposed, is not compatible with traditional brick and mortared stone walls.
6. **Building Elements** - The house's individual elements are integrated into its composition for a balanced and complete design. The one-story elements (front entry and rear porch) and bay window, in particular, complement existing adjacent structures as well.
7. **Roof** - The hipped roof is compatible with many of the contributing structures in the district. Though the district guidelines do not specify a recommended slope for hipped roofs, the proposed house and garage provide a 9:12 slope such as what is recommended for gable roofs. Although

the garage is not highly visible from the street, it is appropriate that its slope is similar to that of the main structure.

8. **Windows and Doors** - *The proportion, size, rhythm and detailing of windows and doors on the house are compatible with that of existing nearby buildings.* The amount, vertical orientation, and double-hung nature of the windows are consistent with existing nearby buildings. The only proposed horizontally oriented windows are small and located on the side elevations. Divided light specifications were not submitted, but the windows should be either simulated or true divided lights. The doors are also compatible in design with those found on area structures.
9. **Porches and Decks** - The front entrance provides appropriate detailing and articulation for the structure's size and style and it effectively provides a *transitional zone between the public outdoors and the private interior.* The screened porch deck is *kept to the rear* of the house, is *visually refined*, and is *integrated into the overall building design.*
10. **Setback, Siting** - The new house faces Summit Avenue and is *sited at a distance not more than 5% out-of-line from the front yard setback of existing adjacent buildings.*
11. **Landscaping** - The seating wall is located between the public space of the sidewalk and the semipublic space of the front yard. The seating wall also functions as a retaining wall, and as such is appropriately detailed with a cap and sited at the property perimeter. The proposed landscaping does not detract from the *street "room".* The privacy fence is proposed only for the side and rear yard, and not in the front yard.
12. **Garages and Parking** - The garage provides parking in the rear yard via the alley as suggested by the district guidelines.
13. The proposal to demolish the existing house and garage will not have an adverse effect on the Program for the Preservation and architectural control of the Summit Avenue West Heritage Preservation District (Leg. Code §73.06 (e)).
14. The proposed new house and garage will not have an adverse effect on the Program for the Preservation and architectural control of the Summit Avenue West Heritage Preservation District (Leg. Code §73.06 (e)).

#### F. STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Based on the findings, staff recommends approval of the demolition and building permit application subject to the following additional conditions:

1. All final materials, details and colors shall be reviewed and approved by HPC staff or the HPC, including simulated or true divided lights for the windows.
2. Any revisions to the approved plans must be submitted to the HPC and/or staff for review.
3. The HPC stamped approved plans must be kept on site during the construction project.
4. The shingles shall have a solid paint or stain finish.
5. The front yard seating wall shall be no higher than 3' above adjacent sidewalk grade.
6. The seating wall shall be revised to use a more formal mortared stone or brick and submitted to staff for final approval.

#### G. ATTACHMENTS

1. HPC Design Review Application
2. Architectural Exhibits



Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Commission  
Department of Planning and Economic Development  
25 Fourth Street West, Suite 1400  
Saint Paul, MN 55102  
Phone: (651) 266-9078

## HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION DESIGN REVIEW APPLICATION

This application must be completed in addition to the appropriate city permit application if the affected property is an individually designated landmark or located within an historic district. For applications that must be reviewed by the Heritage Preservation Commission refer to the HPC Meeting schedule for meeting dates and deadlines.

### 1. CATEGORY

Please check the category that best describes the proposed work

- |  |  |  |
|--|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Repair/Rehabilitation | <input type="checkbox"/> Sign/Awning                     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> New Construction/Addition/<br>Alteration |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Moving                | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Fence/Retaining Wall | <input type="checkbox"/> Pre-Application Review Only                         |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Demolition | <input type="checkbox"/> Other _____                     |  |

### 2. PROJECT ADDRESS

Street and number: 1472-74 SUMMIT AVE Zip Code: 55105

### 3. APPLICANT INFORMATION

Name of contact person: PHIL AND STEPHANIE MARTINEAU

Company: \_\_\_\_\_

Street and number: 812 ST JAMES STREET → 215 10th Ave. S.  
City: PITTSBURGH State: PA Zip Code: 15232 Unit 235  
Mpls. 55415

Phone number: (412) 622-7397 e-mail: ICEDANCER SJM  
CELL: 651-506-5962 @MSN.COM

### 4. PROPERTY OWNER(S) INFORMATION (If different from applicant)

Name: ERIC M KUSTRITZ AND LORI KUSTRITZ

Street and number: 80 VIRGINIA ST

City: ST PAUL State: MN Zip Code: 55102

Phone number: (612) 308-1000 e-mail: N/A

THE PROPERTY SALE<sup>1</sup> TO THE APPLICANTS IS  
SCHEDULED TO CLOSE ON OR BEFORE AUG. 1ST

**5. PROJECT ARCHITECT (If applicable)**

Contact person: DALE MULFINGER  
Company: SALA ARCHITECTS, INC  
Street and number: 326 EAST HENNEPIN AVE #200  
City: MINNEAPOLIS State: MN Zip Code: 55414  
Phone number: (612) 767-4124 e-mail: DMULFINGER@SALAARCH.COM

**6. PROJECT DESCRIPTION**

Completely describe ALL exterior changes being proposed for the property. Include changes to architectural details such as windows, doors, siding, railings, steps, trim, roof, foundation or porches. Attach specifications for doors, windows, lighting and other features, if applicable, including color and material samples.

*See attachment*

*Attach additional sheets if necessary*

**7. ATTACHMENTS**

Refer to the *Design Review Process sheet* for required information or attachments.

**\*\*INCOMPLETE APPLICATIONS WILL BE RETURNED\*\***

**ARE THE NECESSARY ATTACHMENTS AND INFORMATION INCLUDED?**

☐ YES

Will any federal money be used in this project?

YES ☐ NO ☒

Are you applying for the Investment Tax Credits?

YES ☐ NO ☒



I, the undersigned, understand that the Design Review Application is limited to the aforementioned work to the affected property. I further understand that any additional exterior work to be done under my ownership must be submitted by application to the St. Paul Heritage Preservation Commission. Any unauthorized work will be required to be removed.

Signature of applicant: Stephane Martineau Date: July 3, 2013

Signature of owner: \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_

**FOR HPC OFFICE USE ONLY**

Date received: \_\_\_\_\_ FILE NO. \_\_\_\_\_

District: \_\_\_\_\_/Individual Site: \_\_\_\_\_

Contributing/Non-contributing/Pivotal/Supportive/:

Type of work: Minor/Moderate/Major

\_\_\_\_ Requires staff review

Supporting data: YES NO  
Complete application: YES NO

The following condition(s) must be met in order for application to conform to preservation program:

**It has been determined that the work to be performed pursuant to the application does not adversely affect the program for preservation and architectural control of the heritage preservation district or site (Ch.73.06).**

\_\_\_\_\_  
HPC staff approval

Date \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_ Requires Commission review

Submitted:

- ☐ 3 Sets of Plans
- ☐ 15 Sets of Plans reduced to 8 ½" by 11" or 11" by 17"
- ☐ Photographs
- ☐ City Permit Application
- ☐ Complete HPC Design Review application

Hearing Date set for: \_\_\_\_\_

City Permit # \_\_\_\_\_ - \_\_\_\_\_

## Attachment to application for 1474 Summit Avenue

### 6. Project Description

The existing duplex proposed for demolition is a non-contributing structure to the district and was built in 1957, outside the period of significance for the district. The structure is only one-story and the front yard setback is less than the adjacent homes. In addition, the roof pitch is less than 8:12.

The home proposed for the lot is over 25' high with a height that is between the heights of the adjacent homes. The setback of the second-story facade aligns with the second story facade of the adjacent homes. One-story elements (including bay window and entrance porch) project closer to the street, which is similar to the adjacent homes.

The home's wood shingle siding is similar to wood siding found on other nearby homes in the district. A Kasota limestone veneer is used on the foundation and entrance porch. Asphalt shingles will create a look that is similar to cut wood shingles. Except for white trim, all colors will be earth tones that are similar to the colors found in nearby homes.

The design incorporates a bay window and open entry porch, which are elements found in other homes in the district. The roof is hipped and the detached garage is located in the rear of the property with access from the alley. The double-hung windows have a strong vertical orientation and are the approximate size of the windows on one of the adjacent residences as well as other homes in the district. Windows facing the street are grouped in a manner similar to the adjacent homes as well as other homes in the district.

The landscape plan features a seat height retaining wall on Summit Avenue, which will be constructed of limestone similar in color to the house foundation. A wood privacy fence with a trellis feature on the upper portion will run along the east lot line beginning midway on the side of the house all the way to the alley.